
1. Introduction

1.1 Overview of the Final Environmental Impact Report

Pursuant to Section 15132 of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines (State CEQA Guidelines), a final environmental impact report (FEIR) consists of:

- the draft environmental impact report (DEIR) or a revision of the DEIR;
- comments and recommendations received on the DEIR, either verbatim or in summary;
- a list of persons, organizations, and public agencies commenting on the DEIR;
- the responses of the lead agency to significant environmental points raised during the review and consultation process; and
- any other information added by the lead agency.

Accordingly, the FEIR for the proposed River West Fresno, Eaton Trail Extension Project (project) consists of two parts:

- *Volume I* includes the DEIR with appendices, distributed for public review and comment February 15–April 15, 2017, as amended by the Partially Revised DEIR with appendices, distributed for public review and comment August 17–October 2, 2017.
- *Volume II* consists of:
 - a compilation of the comments received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR;
 - the written responses to those comments prepared by the San Joaquin River Conservancy (Conservancy);
 - indices (i.e., lists) of State and regional/local agencies, organizations, tribes, and individuals that commented on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR;
 - a copy of the comment letters on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR in their original form (i.e., photocopies of comment letters); and
 - responses to comments on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR.

All of the documents described above, together composing the environmental record for the project, are available for public review at the following address:

Melinda Marks, Executive Officer
San Joaquin River Conservancy
5469 E. Olive Avenue
Fresno, CA 93727
Melinda.Marks@sjrc.ca.gov

1.2 Introduction to the Comments and Responses

This document presents the comments received during the public review periods for the February 2017 DEIR and the August 2017 Partially Revised DEIR and provides written responses to those comments. In total, 240 comment letters were received during the public review period for the DEIR and the Partially Revised DEIR. The comments received on both the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR are included in this document in accordance with Section 15132 of the State CEQA Guidelines.

The index presented in Volume II, Chapter 2 of this FEIR lists the State and regional/local agencies, organizations, tribes, and individuals that submitted comments on the February 2017 DEIR and the August 2017 Partially Revised DEIR. Chapter 2 also presents the Conservancy's individual responses to comments received during the review periods for the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR.

The "Comments and Responses to Comments" present each comment letter, followed immediately by responses to each comment in the letter. The comments and responses are organized into categories based on the affiliation of the commenter. The comments are presented in the following order: State agencies, regional and local agencies, organizations, tribes, and interested individuals. For each category, comments and responses on the February 2017 DEIR are presented first, followed by comments and responses on the August 2017 Partially Revised DEIR.

Alphanumeric index systems are used to identify each comment and response, and are keyed to each letter and the individual comments therein. For example:

- The first letter in the group of State agencies submitting comments on the February 2017 DEIR is from the California State Lands Commission, and the text of the letter is considered to have 12 individual comments. The letter was assigned the alphanumeric label "S-1" and responses are labeled S-1A, S-1B, S-1C, etc.
- The first letter in the group of regional and local agencies submitting comments on the August 2017 Partially Revised DEIR is from Fresno City Manager Wilma Quan-Schechter, and the text of the letter is considered to have four individual comments. The letter was assigned the alphanumeric label "RL-1" and responses are labeled RL-1-1, RL-1-2, RL-1-3, etc.

To assist the reader in reviewing and using the responses to comments, a master index has been provided (see Table 2-1). The index provides the alphanumeric label number, commenter name, affiliation (i.e., name of agency or organization that the author represents), and comment letter date (if provided).

This page intentionally left blank.

2. Comments and Responses to Comments

2.1 Purpose

Section 15088 of the State CEQA Guidelines outlines the process for the Conservancy to evaluate and respond to comments raised on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR. At the close of the respective 45-day public review periods for the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR, the Conservancy organized the comments received into an index (Table 2-1). The comments were reviewed to determine the nature of the issues discussed, and reasoned responses to all comments raising environmental issues were prepared in good faith.

The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) does not require that the Conservancy respond to conclusory statements unsupported by factual information or unrelated to environmental topics. Therefore, the Conservancy's responses focus on comments regarding environmental issues that provide arguments supported by evidence.

2.2 Comments

Table 2-1 lists the comments received during the total 90-day public review period for the project. The table identifies each commenter, designates a unique identification label for each comment letter, and lists the date the letter was received. Complete copies of the comment letters are provided in this chapter along with the responses to comments.

Table 2-1 List of Written Comments Received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR		
Commenting Entity Author	Date	Comment Letter ID
STATE AGENCIES		
<i>Comment Letters Received on the February 2017 DEIR</i>		
California State Lands Commission	April 17, 2017	S-1
Central Valley Flood Protection Board	April 3, 2017	S-2
31st Assembly District, Assemblymember Dr. Joaquin Arambula	April 13, 2017	S-3
<i>Comment Letters Received on the August 2017 Partially Revised DEIR</i>		
Governor's Office of Planning and Research, State Clearinghouse and Planning Unit	October 3, 2017	RS-1
California State Lands Commission	October 2, 2017	RS-2
REGIONAL AND LOCAL AGENCIES		
<i>Comment Letters Received on the February 2017 DEIR</i>		
County of Fresno Department of Public Works and Planning	April 12, 2017	L-1
City of Fresno, Mayor Lee Brand	April 12, 2017	L-2
City of Fresno, City Manager Bruce Rudd	April 13, 2017	L-3
City of Fresno, Development and Resource Management Department	April 14, 2017	L-4
City of Fresno, Councilmember Steve Brandau	April 14, 2017	L-5
City of Fresno, Councilmember Esmeralda Soria	March 28, 2017	L-6
Fresno Metropolitan Flood Control District	April 14, 2017	L-7
<i>Comment Letters Received on the August 2017 Partially Revised DEIR</i>		
City of Fresno, City Manager Wilma Quan-Schechter	October 3, 2017	RL-1
County of Fresno, Supervisor Andreas Borgeas, District Two	September 28, 2017	RL-2
County of Fresno Department of Public Works and Planning	October 2, 2017	RL-3
Fresno Metropolitan Flood Control District	October 3, 2017	RL-4
ORGANIZATIONS		
<i>Comment Letters Received on the February 2017 DEIR</i>		
Trust for Public Land	April 13, 2017	O-1
Audubon Society Central Valley and Sierra Chapter	April 14, 2017	O-2
Fresno Audubon Society	April 11, 2017	O-3
San Joaquin Valley Latino Environmental Advancement & Policy Project	April 13, 2017	O-4
Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability	April 14, 2017	O-5
Fresno Interdenominational Refugee Ministries	April 13, 2017	O-6
Fresno Interdenominational Refugee Ministries	April 11, 2017	O-7

Table 2-1 List of Written Comments Received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR		
Commenting Entity Author	Date	Comment Letter ID
Shute, Mihaly & Weinberger LLP on behalf of San Joaquin River Parkway and Conservation Trust	April 14, 2017	O-8
Wanger Jones Helsley PC on behalf of San Joaquin River Access Coalition	April 13, 2017	O-9
<i>Comment Letters Received on the August 2017 Partially Revised DEIR</i>		
Wanger Jones Helsley PC on behalf of San Joaquin River Access Coalition	September 28, 2017	RO-1
Shute, Mihaly & Weinberger LLP on behalf of San Joaquin River Parkway and Conservation Trust	September 26, 2017	RO-2
NATIVE AMERICAN TRIBES		
<i>Comment Letters Received on the February 2017 DEIR</i>		
Dumna Wo Wah Tribal Government	April 17, 2017	T-1
INDIVIDUALS		
<i>Comment Letters Received on the February 2017 DEIR</i>		
David Gjestson	February 16, 2017	I-1
Richard Carpenter	February 17, 2017	I-2
Jeanine Yoder	February 17, 2017	I-3
Richard Carpenter	February 21, 2017	I-4
Phil Decker	March 5, 2017	I-5
Laura Silberman	March 13, 2017	I-6
Trish Arnold	March 14, 2017	I-7
Candy Barnes	March 14, 2017	I-8
Merle Hanson	March 14, 2017	I-9
Pamela Hartman	March 14, 2017	I-10
Jim Hering	March 14, 2017	I-11
K. Herrington	March 14, 2017	I-12
Anthony Molina	March 14, 2017	I-13
Carolyn Nolan	March 14, 2017	I-14
Corinne Peters	March 14, 2017	I-15
Nicholas Paladino	March 14, 2017	I-16
Tony Rainaldi	March 14, 2017	I-17
Richard Sloan	March 14, 2017	I-18
Sara Snell	March 14, 2017	I-19
Keith B. Teague	March 14, 2017	I-20

**Table 2-1
List of Written Comments Received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR**

Commenting Entity Author	Date	Comment Letter ID
Jennifer Williamson	March 14, 2017	I-21
Sharon Benes	March 15, 2017	I-22
Connie Young	March 15, 2017	I-23
Sheila Broumley	March 16, 2017	I-24
Laura Silberman	March 16, 2017	I-25
Diane Merrill	March 17, 2017	I-26
Wendell Stephenson	March 19, 2017	I-27
Michael Smith	March 20, 2017	I-28
Andreas Borgeas	March 26, 2017	I-29
Stan Spano	March 27, 2017	I-30
Gerald and Kathleen Vinnard	March 28, 2017	I-31
Anonymous	March 29, 2017	I-32
Rosemary Andrew	April 4, 2017	I-33
Kay and Narvell Conner	April 4, 2017	I-34
Barry Bauer	April 5, 2017	I-35
Desa Belyea	April 5, 2017	I-36
Marian Faria	April 5, 2017	I-37
Stephen Fretz and Lynn Moss	April 5, 2017	I-38
Anthony Molina	April 5, 2017	I-39
Tim Taira	April 5, 2017	I-40
Stephen and Judith Henry	April 4, 2017	I-41
Louise Richardson	April 6, 2017	I-42
Jim and Peggy Riley	April 6, 2017	I-43
Susan Schweda	April 6, 2017	I-44
Carol Van Dyne	April 6, 2017	I-45
Timothy Van Dyne	April 6, 2017	I-46
John Cameron	April 7, 2017	I-47
Curtis Cole	April 7, 2017	I-48
Pamela Hartman	April 7, 2017	I-49
Georgia Murach	April 7, 2017	I-50
Anna and Bill Wattenbarger	April 7, 2017	I-51

Table 2-1
List of Written Comments Received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR

Commenting Entity Author	Date	Comment Letter ID
Don and Diane Beauregard	April 8, 2017	I-52
Dr. W. Timothy Brox, MD	April 8, 2017	I-53
Laura Moore (Carlis)	April 8/April 10, 2017	I-54
Joyce Fields-Keene	April 9, 2017	I-55
Lucy Hunt-Pierson	April 9, 2017	I-56
Kathy and Steve Jackson	April 9, 2017	I-57
Donn Rooney	April 9, 2017	I-58
Tyler Dockstader	April 10, 2017	I-59
Rhoda Howell-Gonzales	April 10, 2017	I-60
Stacy Roque	April 10, 2017	I-61
Ricardo Silberman	April 10, 2017	I-62
Susan V. Stacier	April 10, 2017	I-63
Sheri Bohigian	April 11, 2017	I-64
Brad Castillo	April 11, 2017	I-65
Sarah and Taylor Kolb	April 11, 2017	I-66
Shelley Lew	April 11, 2017	I-67
Chuck and Brenda Markham	April 11, 2017	I-68
Margaret Nelson	April 11, 2017	I-69
Stacy Roque	April 11, 2017	I-70
Harmolene Silva	April 11, 2017	I-71
Steve and Sandy Slumberger	April 11, 2017	I-72
Maurice Talbot	April 11, 2017	I-73
Robin Tokmakian	April 11, 2017	I-74
Howard K. Watkins	April 11, 2017	I-75
Scott B. Wells	April 11, 2017	I-76
Barry and Rosemarie Bauer	April 12, 2017	I-77
Thomas W. Beggs	April 12, 2017	I-78
Gary Bluth	April 12, 2017	I-79
Judy Davis	April 12, 2017	I-80
Steve and Beverly Forker	April 12, 2017	I-81
David Grubbs	April 12, 2017	I-82

**Table 2-1
List of Written Comments Received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR**

Commenting Entity Author	Date	Comment Letter ID
Jim and Lynda Henricy	April 12, 2017	I-83
Kevin and Anna Hook	April 12, 2017	I-84
Patrick A. Kelly, Ph.D.	April 12, 2017	I-85
David Kerkezian	April 12, 2017	I-86
Barbara Borden Kirby	April 12, 2017	I-87
Herb Morgenstern	April 12, 2017	I-88
Dan Morrow	April 12, 2017	I-89
Mehmet Noyan	April 12, 2017	I-90
Lyn Peters	April 12, 2017	I-91
Mary Savala	April 12, 2017	I-92
Jeffrey L. Stacier	April 12, 2017	I-93
Joyce Barserian	April 13, 2017	I-94
Susan Miller Coffman	April 13, 2017	I-95
Klytia and Bob Cozzi	April 13, 2017	I-96
Darryl W. Curry	April 13, 2017	I-97
Beth and Chip Davis	April 13, 2017	I-98
John R. Donaldson	April 13, 2017	I-99
Cindy Friday Beeman	April 13, 2017	I-100
Afarin Karimkhanzand	April 13, 2017	I-101
Rose Marie Kuhn	April 13, 2017	I-102
Sam Lane	April 13, 2017	I-103
James R. Lowell, Jr.	April 13, 2017	I-104
Cynthia Parker	April 13, 2017	I-105
Kevin Peters	April 13, 2017	I-106
Jeffrey M. Reid (McCormick, Barstow, Sheppard, Wayte & Carruth LLP, representing Cliff Tutelian and Tutelian & Co.)	April 13, 2017	I-107
Bruce A. Roberts	April 13, 2017	I-108
Bonnie Rooney	April 13, 2017	I-109
Sue Seiden	April 13, 2017	I-110
Tom Thomas	April 13, 2017	I-111
Bert and Edith Tribbey	April 13, 2017	I-112

Table 2-1
List of Written Comments Received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR

Commenting Entity Author	Date	Comment Letter ID
Cliff Tutelian	April 13, 2017	I-113
Tony Rainaldi and Trish Arnold	April 14, 2017	I-114
Tori and Kenny Alles	April 14, 2017	I-115
Maureen Armstrong	April 14, 2017	I-116
Saeed Attar	April 14, 2017	I-117
Vishnu and Lavanya Bobba	April 14, 2017	I-118
Andreas Borgeas	April 14, 2017	I-119
Sue Coggins	April 14, 2017	I-120
Denise Curry	April 14, 2017	I-121
Ujagger S. and Inderjit K. Dhillon	April 14, 2017	I-122
Lisa Jordan Dixon	April 14, 2017	I-123
Nancy Gilmore	April 14, 2017	I-124
Bruce Gray	April 14, 2017	I-125
Ellen Hemink	April 14, 2017	I-126
Larry Hendrickson	April 14, 2017	I-127
Thomas Holyoke	April 14, 2017	I-128
Linda Hudson	April 14, 2017	I-129
James and Judy Keighley	April 14, 2017	I-130
Dave Koehler	April 14, 2017	I-131
Julie Linxwiler	April 14, 2017	I-132
Rachel Locke	April 14, 2017	I-133
George Madrid	April 14, 2017	I-134
Satya Mahanty	April 14, 2017	I-135
H. Ray McKnight	April 14, 2017	I-136
John and Zarrin Nelson	April 14, 2017	I-137
Charles D. Oren	April 14, 2017	I-138
Tracy L. Parker	April 14, 2017	I-139
Blake Patton	April 14, 2017	I-140
Cyndi Peterson	April 14, 2017	I-141
Denise Dadian Sniffin, Psy.D.	April 14, 2017	I-142
Jacqueline Spencer	April 14, 2017	I-143

**Table 2-1
List of Written Comments Received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR**

Commenting Entity Author	Date	Comment Letter ID
Judith Swick	April 14, 2017	I-144
Peter and Laurie Weber	April 14, 2017	I-145
Tom Wielicki	April 14, 2017	I-146
Connie Young	April 14, 2017	I-147
Tom Zimoski	April 14, 2017	I-148
Linda Amparano	April 15, 2017	I-149
Susan B. Anderson	April 15, 2017	I-150
Roger Anthony	April 15, 2017	I-151
Tim Bakman	April 15, 2017	I-152
Daryl L. Balch	April 15, 2017	I-153
Daniel R. Baxter, M.D.	April 15, 2017	I-154
Bart Bohn	April 15, 2017	I-155
Judy Brandon	April 15, 2017	I-156
Wendy Brox	April 15, 2017	I-157
Catherine Caples	April 15, 2017	I-158
Michael Carrillo	April 15, 2017	I-159
Greg and Linda Clark	April 15, 2017	I-160
Sharon Benes	April 16, 2017	I-161
Ricardo and Pricila Centeno	April 16, 2017	I-162
Manny and Lynn Fagundes	April 15, 2017	I-163
Jennifer Martin Gaede and Don Gaede	April 16, 2017	I-164
Ernie Gee	April 16, 2017	I-165
Bill Golden	April 15, 2017	I-166
James R. Gonzales	April 15, 2017	I-167
Denise Gravano	April 15, 2017	I-168
Sheila Hakimipour	April 15, 2017	I-169
Heady S.	April 12, 2017	I-170
Beverly Hogue	April 15, 2017	I-171
Jon and Amie Holmes	April 15, 2017	I-172
Pat Howe	April 17, 2017	I-173
Karen Humphrey	April 15, 2017	I-174

**Table 2-1
List of Written Comments Received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR**

Commenting Entity Author	Date	Comment Letter ID
Betty Johnson	April 15, 2017	I-175
Shirley Kovacs	April 15, 2017	I-176
Sam Lane	April 15, 2017	I-177
Dr. Oz. M. Lone Ph.D.	April 15, 2017	I-178
Harry Massucco	April 15, 2017	I-179
Sandra McCormick	April 15, 2017	I-180
Linda Medel	April 15, 2017	I-181
Leighann Milford	April 15, 2017	I-182
Michael Murphy	April 15, 2017	I-183
Elizabeth Olin	April 16, 2017	I-184
Gregory Olin	April 15, 2017	I-185
Yvonne Osuna	April 15, 2017	I-186
Char Parrish	April 15, 2017	I-187
Craig Poole	April 15, 2017	I-188
Greg Powell	April 15, 2017	I-189
Sharon Powers	April 16, 2017	I-190
Dale and Debbie Priaulx	April 15, 2017	I-191
Gaylord R. Ransom	April 15, 2017	I-192
Karla Ransom	April 15, 2017	I-193
Adolfo Recinos Sorto	April 17, 2017	I-194
William Sharwood	April 15, 2017	I-195
Faith Sidlow	April 15, 2017	I-196
Laura Silberman	April 15, 2017	I-197
Susan D. Silveira	April 15, 2017	I-198
Jervy Smith	April 15, 2017	I-199
Dan Sniffin	April 14, 2017	I-200
Patrick Smith and Richard Walters	April 15, 2017	I-201
Clare Staham	April 15, 2017	I-202
Yolanda Statham	April 15, 2017	I-203
Joan Stimmell	April 15, 2017	I-204
S. Brett Sutton	April 15, 2017	I-205

**Table 2-1
List of Written Comments Received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR**

Commenting Entity Author	Date	Comment Letter ID
Jeff Trafican	April 15, 2017	I-206
Kristine Walter	April 15, 2017	I-207
Riley Walter	April 15, 2017	I-208
Anna Wielicki	April 15, 2017	I-209
Vincent Yau	April 15, 2017	I-210
Bill and Marlene Youpel	April 15, 2017	I-211
Andrea De Zubiria	April 15, 2017	I-212
Comment Letters Received on the August 2017 Partially Revised DEIR		
John P. Kinsey (Wanger, Jones, Helsey LLP, for the San Joaquin River Access Coalition)	September 28, 2017	RI-1
Rosemary Andrew	September 27, 2017	RI-2
Arturo Arias	October 3, 2017	RI-3
Fernando Baca	October 3, 2017	RI-4
Joyce Barserian	September 28, 2017	RI-5
Barry and Rosemarie Bauer	September 28, 2017	RI-6
Thomas J. Bohigian	October 3, 2017	RI-7
Jeffrey M. Reid (McCormick, Barstow, Sheppard, Wayte & Carruth LLP, representing Cliff Tutelian and Tutelian & Co.)	September 12, 2017	RI-8
Christopher A. Brown	October 2, 2017	RI-9
Richard Carpenter	August 31, 2017	RI-10
Wendy Dockstader	October 3, 2017	RI-11
Melissa Dominguez	October 3, 2017	RI-12
Juan Esparza Loera	October 3, 2017	RI-13
Linda Foster	September 26/ October 3, 2017	RI-14
Begered Ghazi	October 3, 2017	RI-15
Runak Ghazi	October 3, 2017	RI-16
Rhoda Gonzales	September 28, 2017	RI-17
David Grubbs	October 1, 2017	RI-18
Stephen Gulley	September 28, 2017	RI-19
Darryl Hanoian	September 29, 2017	RI-20
Susan Haskell	October 3, 2017	RI-21

Table 2-1
List of Written Comments Received on the DEIR and Partially Revised DEIR

Commenting Entity Author	Date	Comment Letter ID
Ellen Hemink	October 2, 2017	RI-22
Pat Howe	October 3, 2017	RI-23
Erica Hurtado	October 3, 2017	RI-24
Steve and Kathy Jackson	October 1, 2017	RI-25
George Madrid	October 4, 2017	RI-26
Jonelle Mejia	October 3, 2017	RI-27
Eric Olson	October 3, 2017	RI-28
Marcella Osterhaus	October 1, 2017	RI-29
Sarah Parkes	October 3, 2017	RI-30
Staceyann Perez	October 3, 2017	RI-31
Dale and Debbie Prialux	October 3, 2017	RI-32
R. L. Chip Putnam	September 19, 2017	RI-33
Rick Ransom	September 26, 2017	RI-34
Jim Richardson	September 26, 2017	RI-35
Susan Schweda	September 29, 2017	RI-36
Michelle Hanrahan Shafer	October 3, 2017	RI-37
Laura Silberman	October 2, 2017	RI-38
Susan Staicer	October 2, 2017	RI-39
Clare Statham	October 2, 2017	RI-40
Carol Van Dyne	September 28, 2017	RI-41
Gerald Vinnard	September 23, 2017	RI-42
Kristine Walter	October 3, 2017	RI-43
Katie Wara	October 3, 2017	RI-44
Anna Wattenbarger	October 3, 2017	RI-45
Peter E. Weber	October 2, 2017	RI-46
William and Marlene Youpel	October 3, 2017	RI-47
Tom Zimoski	October 3, 2017	RI-48

This page intentionally left blank.